

## JOINT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

13 SEPTEMBER 2017

Present: County Councillor Howells(Chairperson)  
County Councillors Ebrahim, Gordon, Gavin Hill-John,  
Owen Jones, Lancaster, Mackie, Owen, Parkhill, Patel, Robson,  
Stubbs, Wong and Wood

### 5 : APPOINTMENT OF CHAIRPERSON

Councillor Nigel Howells was nominated to be Chairperson by Councillor Patel and this was seconded by Councillor Gavin Hill-John.

Councillor Howells took the Chair.

### 6 : APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors P Hill-John and Lay.

### 7 : DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Declarations of interest were received from the following:

Councillor Stubbs – Personal interest as a non-executive Director of Cardiff Bus.

Councillor Robson – Personal interest as a non-executive Director of Cardiff Bus; and the party involved is a former family friend.

Councillor G Hill-John - Personal interest as a non-executive Director of Cardiff Bus.

Councillor Patel – Personal and Prejudicial interest – former Cabinet Member involved in the decision. Councillor Patel left the meeting.

### 8 : MINUTES

The minutes of the Joint Environment and Economy and Culture Scrutiny Committee held on 18 July 2017 were agreed as a correct record and signed by the Chairperson.

### 9 : FUNDING OF THE NEW BUS TRANSPORT INTERCHANGE - CONSIDERATION OF CALLED IN CABINET DECISION CAB/17/11; REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR FOR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

The Chairperson welcomed Councillor Neil McEvoy, Councillor Russell Goodway, Cabinet Member for Investment and Development, Neil Hanratty, Director of Economic Development, Geoff Shimell, Legal Services - Property and Development to the meeting.

The Chairperson sought Committee's approval to consider the Call – in at this meeting rather than refer it for consideration by Full Council to which the Committee agreed.

The Chairperson invited Councillor Neil McEvoy to explain the reasons for calling in the decision.

Councillor McEvoy stated that he considered the decision needed scrutiny as there was lots of opposition from the public, he stated that there was strength of feeling as the site was a gateway to the Capital City of Wales; he considered that the decision needed Full Council Discussion.

The Chairperson sought approval that Committee were still minded to consider the Call-in rather than defer to Full Council. Committee agreed.

The Chairperson reminded Members that the papers contain confidential, exempt information in Appendices 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6. Committee are required to consider these Appendices in a closed session, in accordance with paragraph 14 of Part 4, and paragraph 21 of Part 5 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972. Accordingly, the Chairperson moved that Committee resolve to exclude the Public from the meeting at this point.

The resolution was passed therefore the Chairperson requested that members of the public and the press leave the Committee room.

After the closed session the Chairperson stated he would re-open the meeting to the public, so that Committee can hear from external witnesses who have expressed an interest in making a statement on the proposal to the Committee. The Chairperson invited Dr Max Wallis to present his statement to Committee.

Dr Wallis read out the following statement:

*I am heartened to see the new Cabinet aiming the new transport interchange to be:*

- *at the heart of the Cardiff Metro with a state-of-the-art bus station facility*
- *to equip the city with the modern transport interchange befitting our capital*

*We feared the Bus station would take second place to serving the new offices and taking traffic to and from the new BBC and office buildings.*

*Congestion, delays and air pollution on Westgate St, Wood St into lower St Marys Street would remain.*

*Previously the Metro was a possible add-on, now we can see metro-trams and/or rapid transit buses being integrated into the Transport Interchange.*

***New Opportunity*** - *Network Rail carpark is go and be replaced – on south side of Station.*

*Allows the metro-tram route via Saunders Road.*

*Allows the Buses to use Saunders Rd, not only on match-days for Stadium events, but all days.*

***Problem of the BBC car park***

*commitment of 217 places for the BBC to add to the 83 under their new building.*

*--- considered bus-use would be impeded by the cars to-and-from the carpark.*

- *The problem disappears if those spaces are moved to join the Network rail spaces south of the rail station.*

- *Great benefits of a) construction cost b) commercial high-value space released*

*s.16 ground floor bus station limits the number of columns that can be used in construction ...*

*This dramatically increases the cost per space of providing car parking.*

*Originally was to be underground, under the Bus Station. Switched without realising the much higher cost of parking above the high bus area. Also it takes out high-value commercial space, with low-value car-parking.*

**Problem of high pollution** in a fully-enclosed bus-area needs addressing. NO2 predicted to be several times higher than the legal limit on outdoor NO2. Several times the level in the Air Quality Management Area of Westgate St/lower St Marys Street. New electric buses was one way to solve this, but not even Cardiff Bus is planning to invest in low/zero pollution buses.

State-of-the-art bus station needs good pedestrian access. The bike-hub and rail-station need good cycling access. Saunders Road is the main route to Mill Lane, central library/The Hayes and John Lewis. Also to bus stops in St Marys St. Canal St and Custom House St may remain in use. No planning for high quality footways/signage connecting to the new station. No upgrade of the inadequate passenger facilities, shelters, seating and electronic information boards. No funds allocated for this.

Metro-trams For the option of on-street trams, the original route chosen was the St Marys St/Wood Street route, inserted into a busy, high-conflict zone, adding tramlines for pedestrians to negotiate.

Using Saunders Rd route for metro-trams would go easily into Central Square to the heart of the interchange, Change the taxi-rank into a Tram Station.

Metro rapid-transit buses have not been planned for. Where are they to fit in? Either take over stops in Custom House St and Canal Wharf, or quick access via Saunders Rd into the Bus Station? Regional coaches too, like the T9 and the Aberystwyth service that enter the city via Cardiff Bay.

Commitment to 217 BBC 'non-operational car-parking spaces. Is it unavoidable for the Interchange? Originally underneath, low value space. Rightacres have this commitment. Rightacres have also agreed to replace the Network Rail parking spaces south of the Station. A timing problem if the Brains brewery site is to be used, yet Rightacres are considering moving the BBC spaces there too. Great advantage to central traffic and air pollution to move them there. Also advantage in clearing Saunders Rd for buses, pedestrians (with potential metro-trams).

**CONCLUDE:** ask you to recommend a wider re-think of the plans, use Saunders Rd for normal bus access, support Rightacres moving the BBC car-parking and cut the huge £15million price for just a bus station shell.

The Chairperson invited questions from Members on Dr Wallis' statement to which there were none.

## 10 : CONSIDERATION OF WRITTEN STATEMENTS

No written statements had been received.

## 11 : SUMMING UP

The Chairperson reminded Members that the papers contain confidential, exempt information in Appendices 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6. Committee are required to consider these Appendices in a closed session, in accordance with paragraph 14 of Part 4, and paragraph 21 of Part 5 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972. Accordingly, the Chair moved that Committee resolve to exclude the Public from the meeting at this point.

The resolution was passed and the Chairperson requested that members of the public and the press leave the Committee room for the summing up.

The Chairperson then opened up the meeting to members of the Public for the Way Forward.

Way Forward – The Chairperson sought the Committee’s views regarding whether to refer the matter to the Cabinet or not. Given the views expressed by Members, the Chair sought confirmation that the Committee did not wish to refer the matter to Cabinet. Members agreed with this and stated they would like the following observations and comments passed to Cabinet:

Members welcomed the fact that concerted efforts were being made to secure office usage in the interchange building and hoped that these proved fruitful. However, Members were supportive of a market driven approach for this space as well, subject to further planning application, if required.

Members asked that the Chair re-emphasise the points made in Committee’s previous letter, dated 19 July 2017, regarding: ensuring due diligence checks are applied to ensure robust financial modelling and consideration of legal advice; and being kept informed of progress with the bid to Welsh Government for assistance in meeting technical fit out and highway improvements.

Members shared the wish to see a high quality bus transport interchange in place as soon as possible and looked forward to progress being made with this.